

The Etymological Argument. Fallacy or Sound Move.

Changes to the final Version dated August 20th, 2002.

Please, find the changes documented below. The gravest is the second: The text Popper (1923) does not exist. Page 15 has a new footnote. In section 4.2 I do not equate the Frankfurt school with Marxism as may have been read

Chapter	Page	Type of Change	Was...	Is now...
0	3	Error	This way, you get what is in the text. The second should include the endnotes and the appendix.	This way, you get what is in the text. The second should include the endnotes.
1	5	Error	Popper (1923)	Popper (1963), still looking for the year of the first publication
2	8	grammar	the modern neutrality that linguistics gives acquires by understanding itself as methodically descriptive	the modern neutrality that linguistics acquires by understanding itself as methodically descriptive
2	9	substantial	which would be around 1995	which would be around 1997/98
2.3	14	stylistic	used in or during preparations of discussions	used in (or during preparations of) discussions
	15	substantial as an addition	<p>New endnote 24 and the end of the first paragraph: Right away, the objection is the following: French <i>liberté</i> is English <i>liberty</i> and German <i>Liberalität</i> and not English <i>freedom</i> and German <i>Freiheit</i>. But here, you are only looking at the surface form and state what is similar on the linguistic surface. Yet, what meanings the terms have and, in distinct (nation-cultural) developments have come to have, requires the sort of study that finds relatedness by coming from the side of the meaning and not from the side of the terms.</p> <p>Note also, that a common European tradition of understanding the term freedom in contrast to an American tradition as I describe it here (free individual choice versus individual burden) contrasts distinctly with an Eastern or oriental tradition in which subjects comprehend their freedom as their contingency. Compare Northrop (1959, 1947¹) <i>The Logic of the Sciences and the Humanities</i>, especially the last four chapters, pp.328-399 and Northrop (1946), titled <i>The Meeting of East and West</i>.</p> <p>Given the historic and substantial overlap of Popper's and Northrop's work, it seems worthwhile to compare their standpoints to eventually integrate what Popper offers in criticism of the Social Sciences and the Humanities with the solutions that Northrop offers. Northrop, and that seems crucial, has the cultural knowledge about the Orient that Popper lacks.</p>	
2.4	17	mistake	if you explain to me that you use the word <i>bank</i>	if you explain to me that you use the term <i>bank</i>
		style	they must know exactly what the other wants the term to be understood.	they must know exactly how the other wants the term to be understood.
3.0	21	style	<p>end of first sentence after the quote: endnote 32 from page 25 on 'informative' moved up as note 31.</p>	

The Etymological Argument. Fallacy or Sound Move.

Changes to the final Version dated August 20th, 2002.

Chapter	Page	Type of Change	Was...	Is now...
	22	mistake	...is 1.2.1". In 1.2" the...	...is 1.2.1". In 1.2.1" the...
3.1	23	mistake, reference	the Y in the right column of line 2 must be a Z. Same mistake was carried through to page 38 and also corrected there. Reference for the scheme added: van Eemeren et al. 2000	
4	26	substantial for clarification	I then formulate the final evaluation of the etymological argument of key-terms and state where its detection is especially relevant, namely in the construal of the definitions of key-terms and, critically, the justification of the quality of these definitions.	I then formulate the final evaluation of the etymological argument and state why its detection is especially relevant in the construal of the definitions of key-terms and, critically, the justification of the quality of these definitions.
4.1	26	substantial for clarification	Modern man rediscovered just that and applied it where it works: in taxonomic hierarchies of knowledge, principles of generalizability of, eventually the law.	Modern man rediscovered just that and applied them methodically where they work: in taxonomic hierarchies of knowledge build on principles of generalizability and pertaining to (objective) scientific description as much as to the law.
4.2	29	spelling	Plato needed a definition of the should for a definition of his perfect state.	Plato needed a definition of the soul for a definition of his perfect state.
	29 - 30	substantial for clarification	The Marxists did not stand a chance. Habermas follows Adorno's heritage as an internationally recognized philosopher.	The Marxists, as a third party, did not even stand a chance. Habermas follows primarily Adorno's, not so much Horkheimer's, heritage as an internationally recognized philosopher.
	31	grammar	So the term <i>even</i> is has as its essence what is defined by <i>dividable into the same parts</i> .	So the term <i>even</i> has as its essence what is defined by <i>dividable into the same parts</i> .
4.4	36	Reference	New endnote 55: Menne (1974)	
	37	mistake	To this, finally, corresponds the meaning versus use distinction that specifies exactly what is done with a sign in discourse.	To this, finally, corresponds the <i>mention</i> versus <i>use</i> distinction that specifies exactly what is done with a sign in discourse.
	38	error	see change in the scheme under 3.1 above	
	39	style	The fallacy matrix received table-borders, <i>either</i> and <i>or</i> were deleted.	

The Etymological Argument. Fallacy or Sound Move.

Changes to the final Version dated August 20th, 2002.

Chapter	Page	Type of Change	Was...	Is now...
6	43 44	reference	Added: Goffman, E. (still unspecified), Pekelharing (Bacon, in Press), Saussure (Cours, lacks location & publisher) and Katz & Postal, still missing: Tarski, Carnap, Darwin, Thomas, Buehler and Plato, Aristotle (works).	
	46	mistake	noat	boat
7 Endnotes new numbering				
10		substantial for clarification	Rather, the biological and the linguistic model are both model's of an approaches to evolution.	Rather, the biological and the linguistic model are both model's of an approaches to <i>natural</i> evolution.
12		error	<i>Der Fall der historischen Semantik ist aufs engste mit der Rezeption und dem Einfluss von Saussures Course de Linguistique general.</i>	<i>Der Fall der historischen Semantik ist aufs engste mit der Rezeption und dem Einfluss von Saussures Course de Linguistique general verknüpft</i>
33		reference	The first bible translation and recorded printing stems from Gutenberg in the 15th century.	The first bible translation (from Latin into German) and recorded printing stems from Luther and Gutenberg in the 15th century.
36			---	So, <i>crefice</i> becomes <i>crawfish</i> .
37		addition	'Der Zauber Platons' sits on the second page, though.	'Der Zauber Platons' sits on the second page, though, and German <i>Zauber</i> is English <i>Magic</i> while English <i>Spell</i> would be German <i>Fluch</i> .
38		grammar	Fancy a custom tailored spell-checker, were the data available, could be analysed, backwardly if you like, for what was put into the list.	a custom tailored spell-checker, were the data available, could be analysed, backwardly if you like, for what was put into the list.
41		mistake	edition to the American edition	foreword to the American edition
51		addition	(roman Catholicism and Protestantism, basically)	(Roman Catholicism and Protestantism, basically, for our region, as well as Judaism and Mohammedism further East, though for Judaism, the eastern location-specification is a very problematic modern invention)

The Etymological Argument. Fallacy or Sound Move.

Changes to the final Version dated August 20th, 2002.

Chapter	Page	Type of Change	Was...	Is now...
57		addition	The meaning of the proper name is the referent. No problem. The sense he gives as: 'The sense of a proper name is the way of its being-given.' [<i>Der Sinn des Eigennamens ist die Art seines Gegebenseins.</i> ']	The meaning (German <i>Bedeutung</i> , where <i>auf etwas deuten</i> is English <i>pointing to something</i> , while <i>auf etwas hindeuten</i> is <i>to indicate something</i>) of the proper name is the referent. No problem. Eventually, the meaning (<i>Bedeutung</i>) of the sentence is its truth value (true or false). The sense, now, he gives as:
		clarification	At the time of immigration into Ellis Island, New York, most European immigrants had their names officially Americanised and that morphed into the phonetically available next best representation of their original names.	At the time of immigration into Ellis Island, New York, most European immigrants had their names officially Americanised and that means -- in the happy situations -- morphed into the phonetically available <i>next best representation</i> of their original names.
		error	And some names you can read for the method that the taxonomy, out of which you have one term to look at, how about hyper-and hyper-critical.	And some names you can read for the method that the taxonomists employed, out of which you have one term to look at.
<p>Otherwise I corrected spelling, punctuation and grammatical agreement at various places in the body. Ultimately, I should have planned a one week revision. This would have made sure, that there are obstacles over which the reader has to stumble and make sense of before reading on. My apologies.</p>				